



AN INITIATIVE OF

the de Beaumont Foundation + Kaiser Permanente

# 2018 REPORT METHODOLOGY

CityHealth, an initiative of the de Beaumont Foundation and Kaiser Permanente, released updated 2018 rankings that reveal which of the nation's 40 largest cities have nine evidence-based policies in place that experts say help residents lead healthier lives and make communities thrive. CityHealth awarded each city an overall gold, silver, bronze, or no medal, according to their performance in the assessment. The group also awarded nine policy-specific medals to each city, according to the quality and strength of the laws in place.

Some cities are blocked by their own state from implementing laws they have approved. This practice is called preemption. State preemption prevents local governments from adopting policies that their communities want, repeals existing laws that voters have already approved, and keeps communities from strengthening existing protections. CityHealth data account for when a city is not allowed by the state to put a certain law into practice. Our assessment includes information about laws valid through December 1, 2017; however, cities also received credit if they passed laws prior to May 2018 with future effective dates.

## OVERALL MEDAL STATUS



gold cities received **5 or more gold** medals across each of the 9 policies



silver cities received **5 or more gold or silver** medals across each of the 9 policies



bronze cities received **4 or more gold, silver, or bronze** medals across each of the 9 policies



Cities that received **less than 4** policy medals were not awarded an overall medal

The report is designed to identify which cities are leading the way on policies shown to improve people's health and quality of life. To see the full results of the assessment, visit [cityhealth.org](http://cityhealth.org). Below is a detailed description of the methodology for this report.



# POLICY MEDALS

## Affordable Housing



Inclusionary zoning is an affordable housing policy tool that requires developers to set aside a portion of housing units for low- and moderate-income residents.

Cities' housing markets and the quality of housing stock vary across the United States, which means the best policy approaches will be comprehensive commitments to ensuring affordable, safe, quality options for all. While inclusionary zoning works best in “hot” markets to promote affordable options alongside new development, it’s an important policy for all cities to consider before demand outstrips supply.

Our assessment of inclusionary zoning laws includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws. This scope also includes housing impact fees as an affordable housing policy. Housing impact fees require a developer to pay a fee in exchange for a building permit approval without receiving any benefit or incentive—developers can waive or reduce this fee if they construct affordable housing.

### The state of inclusionary zoning in big US cities

Thirteen out of 40 cities received a medal for inclusionary zoning policies, including 3 gold, 6 silver, and 4 bronze. Los Angeles earned a gold medal for its new inclusionary zoning policy.

### Measuring big cities' inclusionary zoning laws

How did we award inclusionary zoning medals?

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
City has an inclusionary zoning law	Yes	Yes	Yes
Law requires program evaluation	Yes	Yes	Yes
Applies to projects of at least 10 units or less		Yes	Yes
Requires at least 20% of total projects are affordable units			Yes

## Alcohol Sales Control



Neighborhoods with high concentrations of alcohol sales are linked to more drinking and higher rates of violence and driving under the influence. Policies that control the amount of alcohol sales in a neighborhood can reduce crime, increase safety, and reduce spending on health care and criminal justice.

Our assessment of alcohol sales control laws includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of alcohol sales control in big US cities

Fifteen out of 40 cities received a medal for alcohol sales control policies, including 8 gold and 7 silver. For the 2018 assessment, Long Beach earned a silver medal based on an updated scoring of its alcohol sales policy.

### Measuring big cities' alcohol sales control policies

How did we award alcohol sales control policies?

CATEGORY	SILVER	GOLD
City has local zoning and/or licensing laws addressing alcohol outlets	Yes	Yes
City follows best practices for comprehensive local zoning and/or licensing laws addressing alcohol sales for both on- and off-premises consumption, and both prospectively and retrospectively		Yes

## Complete Streets



Complete Streets policies balance people’s needs and safety across all forms of transportation, including walking, biking, public transit and cars. From street lighting to bike lanes to crosswalks, these policies ensure that all residents have safe, convenient ways of getting around and staying active—regardless of their age or ability. Although some cities may have standalone transportation policies that share the ultimate goals of a complete streets program, only succinct and comprehensive programs within a singular area of the law were scored here.

Our assessment of complete streets includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of complete streets policies in big US cities

Thirty-two out of 40 cities received a medal for complete streets policies, including 22 gold, 9 silver, and 1 bronze. Kansas City adopted a new complete streets ordinance, earning a gold medal. Our 2018 assessment confirmed that all California cities are subject to a state performance measure review, which in turn improved the medal status for Fresno, Sacramento, San Diego, San Francisco, and San Jose, which did not already have a clear local performance measure review policy.

### Measuring big cities' complete streets policies

How did we award complete streets policy medals?

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
City has a complete streets policy	Yes	Yes	Yes
Policy requires compliance	Yes	Yes	Yes
Policy accommodates pedestrians, bicyclists, motorists, and public transit vehicles	Yes	Yes	Yes
Policy explicitly accommodates all ages		Yes	Yes
Policy explicitly accommodates all abilities		Yes	Yes
Policy assigns a department to oversee implementation			Yes
Policy requires development of performance measures			Yes

## Earned Sick Leave



Earned sick leave laws reduce the spread of contagious illnesses, increase employment and income stability, and save cities money in health care costs.

Earned sick leave laws require employers to allow people to take paid time off for illnesses or injury for themselves or their family members. The quality of cities' policies is linked to how many family members and what size employer are covered by the law, as well as the number of hours people can earn. Done well, these policies reduce the spread of contagious illnesses, increase employment and income stability, and save cities money in health care costs.

Our assessment of earned sick leave laws includes information about city-specific laws along with relevant county- and state-level laws that affect them.

### The state of earned sick leave laws in big US cities

Nineteen out of 40 cities received a medal for earned sick leave laws, including 3 gold, 5 silver, and 11 bronze. In 2018, Austin passed a new earned sick leave law, earning a gold medal, and the state of Maryland adopted a new earned sick leave law, earning a bronze medal for Baltimore. New York City amended its existing earned sick leave law to improve to a silver medal.

### Measuring big cities' earned sick leave laws

How did we award earned sick leave medals?

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
City has an earned sick leave law	Yes	Yes	Yes
Employee can use earned sick leave to care for family members*		Yes	Yes
Employee can use earned sick leave for domestic violence recovery		Yes	Yes
Minimum amount of earned sick leave time employee can earn		≥40 hours	≥48 hours
Smallest business size covered under earned sick leave law			1 employee

\* For cities to receive full credit, the earned sick leave law must cover spouses, children, parents, grandparents, grandchildren, siblings, and domestic partners. Cities covering fewer categories of family members receive a lower rating.

## Food Safety



Policies requiring food establishments to publicly post safety inspection “grades” contribute to empowering consumers, reducing foodborne illness rates, and cutting down on health care costs. For this assessment, voluntary or electronic restaurant rating systems were deemed out of scope. Inspection reports without a score and/or binary pass/fail systems were also deemed beyond the scope. This assessment specifically addresses policies where an inspection report with a score is required to be posted near the entrance of the restaurant.

Our assessment of restaurant inspection policies includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of restaurant inspection ratings policies in big US cities

Fifteen out of 40 cities received a medal for restaurant inspection ratings policies, including 12 gold and 3 silver. Milwaukee and Seattle each added new restaurant inspection ratings policies that earned a gold medal. Under the 2018 assessment, San Antonio's medal ranking was updated to silver and Louisville improved its restaurant inspection rating law to a gold medal.

### Measuring big cities' restaurant inspection policies

How did we award restaurant inspection policy medals?

CATEGORY	SILVER	GOLD
City uses a mandatory rating system to disclose the restaurant inspection results to the public	Yes	Yes
Restaurants must visibly post on-site ratings/grades	Yes	Yes
Restaurants must post ratings/grades outside before potential customer enters		Yes

## Healthy Food Procurement



Policies that make sure healthy food options are available on public property aid city residents in making smart decisions that will help them achieve and maintain

a healthy weight. A city that has a health procurement policy applicable to all city contracts for food and drinks served at city venues, meetings, and events earned a gold medal. Otherwise, cities earned silver or bronze medals based on their healthy vending machine policies.

Our assessment of healthy procurement policies includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of healthy procurement policies in big US cities

Sixteen out of 40 cities received a medal for their healthy food procurement policies, including 8 gold, 4 silver, and 4 bronze. Louisville added a new healthy vending machine standard, earning a silver medal. Kansas City improved its vending machine percentage of healthy food, earning a silver medal.

### Measuring big cities' health procurement policies

How did we award health procurement policy medals?

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
City has a procurement policy mandating nutrition standards	Yes	Yes	Yes
Policy applies to all city contracts			Yes
If the policy only applies to vending machines	Yes	Yes	
More than 50% of food and beverages must meet standards			
More than 75% of food and beverages must meet standards		Yes	

## High-quality, Universal Pre-Kindergarten



Done right, all children benefit from early childhood education, regardless of family income or zip code. High-quality Pre-K improves children's school readiness

and success: they enter school better prepared and are less likely to repeat a grade or be referred to special education. Long-term benefits include higher high-school graduation rates, lower rates of crime and teen pregnancy, higher lifetime earnings, and better health outcomes.

CityHealth's assessment of Pre-K quality is based on the National Institute of Early Education Research's 10 research-based quality standard benchmarks, along with an assessment of the level of enrollment in the city's largest Pre-K program. These benchmarks are consistent with what research suggests as minimums for highly effective programs. Data are based on assessments as of December 31, 2017.

### The state of high-quality, universal Pre-K in big US cities

Thirty-three out of 40 cities received a medal for high-quality, universal Pre-K, including 5 gold, 8 silver, and 20 bronze. Albuquerque and Seattle both improved to a silver medal up from no medal for the year before. San Antonio improved to a gold medal up from no medal for the year before. Baltimore, Memphis, Oklahoma City, and Washington, D.C. all dropped to a bronze medal due to the more rigorous quality standards used this year.



## Measuring big cities' high-quality, universal Pre-K programs

How did we award high-quality Pre-K medals?

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
Meets 8 out of 10 quality benchmarks for a Pre-K program*		Yes	Yes
Over 30% of children enrolled in Pre-K programs	Yes		Yes

\* The quality benchmarks for a Pre-K program for the 2018 CityHealth update include: early learning and development standards; curriculum supports; teacher has a bachelor's degree; specialized training in Pre-K; assistant teacher has CDA or equivalent; staff professional development; class size of 20 or fewer; staff-child ratio of 1:10 or better; vision, hearing & health screening & referral; and a continuous quality improvement system.

## Smoke-Free Indoor Air Laws



Everyone should have access to clean air. Smoke-free indoor air policies protect non-smokers from the harmful effects of tobacco and reduce smokers' consumption of tobacco at the same time. Tobacco is the largest preventable cause of death.

Our assessment of smoke-free indoor air policies includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of smoke-free indoor air policies in big US cities

Thirty-six out of 40 cities received a medal for smoke-free indoor air laws, including 20 gold, 12 silver, and 4 bronze. Fort Worth updated its smoke-free indoor air law to improve from a bronze medal to a silver and Louisville updated its law to improve from a silver medal to a gold.

### Measuring big cities' smoke-free indoor air policies

How did we award smoke-free indoor air policy medals?

For details on how each of the 40 cities stacks up, go to [www.cityhealth.org](http://www.cityhealth.org).

CityHealth, an initiative of the de Beaumont Foundation and Kaiser Permanente, provides leaders with a package of evidence-based policy solutions that will help millions of people live longer, better lives in vibrant, prosperous communities. CityHealth will regularly evaluate cities on the number and strength of their policies.

<http://www.cityhealth.org/>

CATEGORY	BRONZE	SILVER	GOLD
Total number of met criteria*	Total 2 out of 4 criteria listed below	Total 3 out of 4 criteria listed below	Total 4 out of 4 criteria listed below
1. Smoking is banned in non-hospitality workplaces, including workplaces, child care, and long-term care facilities	Yes	Yes	Yes
2. Smoking is banned in public places	Yes	Yes	Yes
3. Smoking is banned in restaurants		Yes	Yes
4. Smoking is banned in bars			Yes

\* For a bronze medal, a city must meet any 2 of the 4 criteria. For a silver medal, a city must meet any 3 of the 4 criteria. For a gold medal, a city must meet all 4 of the criteria. The examples above for the bronze and silver columns show just one possible combination to earn the respective medals.

## Tobacco 21



Preventing tobacco use has already had a dramatic effect on our country, yet tobacco use remains the single most preventable cause of death and disease. Policies that raise the minimum legal age for the sale of tobacco products to 21 can reduce the number of young people—even those younger than 21—using these products, which greatly reduces their risk for addiction, disease, and premature death. The 2018 assessment also addresses whether the Tobacco 21 law covers e-cigarettes.

Our assessment of Tobacco 21 laws includes information about city-specific laws, along with the relevant county- and state-level laws.

### The state of Tobacco 21 policies in big US cities

Fifteen out of 40 cities received a gold medal for their Tobacco 21 policies. Portland and San Antonio each earned a gold medal in 2018 for new Tobacco 21 policies.

### Measuring big cities' Tobacco 21 policies

How did we award Tobacco 21 policy medals?

CATEGORY	GOLD
Must be at least 21 to purchase tobacco products in the city	Yes
The age restriction explicitly applies to e-cigarettes	Yes